

1917-18.

VICTORIA.

REPORT

OF THE

SELECT COMMITTEE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

ON THE

NATIONALITY OF THE LATE DR. SACHSE;

TOGETHER WITH THE

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE AND APPENDICES.

Ordered by the Legislative Council to be printed, 26th February, 1918.

[*Approximate Cost of Report.*—Preparation, not given. Printing (160 copies), £10.]

By Authority:

ALBERT J. MULLETT, GOVERNMENT PRINTER, MELBOURNE.

EXTRACTED FROM THE MINUTES OF THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

TUESDAY, 19TH FEBRUARY, 1918.

4. NATIONALITY OF THE LATE DR. SACHSE.—The Honorable F. G. Clarke moved, by leave, That a Select Committee consisting of five members be appointed to inquire into the statements made by the Honorable R. B. Rees with reference to the nationality of the father of the Honorable A. O. Sachse, such committee to consist of the Honorables W. J. Beckett, Walter S. Manifold, J. K. Merritt, T. H. Payne, and A. Robinson, with power to send for persons, papers, and records, and to move from place to place; three to be the quorum.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

R E P O R T.

THE SELECT COMMITTEE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL appointed by your Honorable House on the 19th February, 1918, to inquire into the statements made by the Honorable R. B. Rees with reference to the nationality of the father of the Honorable A. O. Sachse, have the honor to report to your Honorable House as follows:—

1. Your Committee met and appointed the Honorable Walter S. Manifold the Chairman thereof.
2. Your Committee took the oral evidence of the Honorable A. O. Sachse and the Honorable R. B. Rees. Your Committee had before it a certified extract from the Register of the birth of the Honorable A. O. Sachse, a certified extract from the Register of the death of his father (Dr. F. O. Sachse), the diploma of Doctor of Medicine issued to Dr. F. O. Sachse, and a letter written in 1855 stating that the oath of naturalization under the Act 11 Vict. No. 39 was taken by Dr. F. O. Sachse, and acknowledging the receipt of the necessary fees.
3. No conclusive evidence was placed before your Committee as to the birthplace of Dr. F. O. Sachse, but such evidence as was available points to the conclusion that that gentleman was born in 1812 at Hallé, which was then part of the Kingdom of Saxony. Hallé was annexed to and became part of Prussia in 1815, and at the time of the birth of the Honorable A. O. Sachse at Toowoomba, Queensland, Hallé was part of Prussia.
4. Dr. F. O. Sachse appears to have been naturalized in that part of New South Wales now known as Queensland in 1855, and to have died at Toowoomba in 1873.
5. Your Committee are of opinion that the Honorable A. O. Sachse was in error in stating to the Council that his father (Dr. F. O. Sachse) was born in Paris while his (Dr. F. O. Sachse's) parents were on a visit to that city. The statement was made on the strength of the Honorable A. O. Sachse's recollection of a conversation between his father and some friends. Had the birth actually taken place in Paris that would not have altered what was apparently the Saxon nationality of Dr. F. O. Sachse.
6. Your Committee were unable to obtain documentary evidence relating to events which occurred more than 100 years ago, but in the Diploma of Medicine and Surgery issued to Dr. F. O. Sachse in 1839 that gentleman is described as a Saxon.
7. Your Committee have no reason to doubt that the Honorable A. O. Sachse's statement to the Council on 4th December, 1917, as to his father's birthplace was made in good faith and with a belief in its truth.

Committee Room,
26th February, 1918.

MINUTES OF EVIDENCE.

LIST OF WITNESSES.

	PAGE
Hon. A. O. Sachse	4, 7
Hon. R. B. Rees	6

TUESDAY, 19TH FEBRUARY, 1918.

Present:

The Hon. WALTER S. MANIFOLD (in the Chair);
The Hon. W. J. Beckett, | The Hon. T. H. Payne,
The Hon. J. K. Merritt, | The Hon. A. Robinson.

The Clerk of the Council laid a certified copy of the certificate of death of Dr. F. O. Sachse (*Exhibit marked "A"*), and a certified copy of the certificate of birth of the Honorable A. O. Sachse (*Exhibit marked "B"*) before the Committee.

The Honorable A. O. Sachse examined.

1. *By the Chairman.*—Do you admit that this death certificate (*Exhibit "A"*) and this birth certificate (*Exhibit "B"*) relate to your father and yourself?—I have not had time to examine them. I have looked at this document casually, for a moment only. I should like to look through these quietly—the death certificate and the birth certificate.

2. Is that your father—Frederick Otto Sachse?—It appears correct. My grandmother's name I do not know. I never did. That is his mother's name, presumably. "Amelia Frances" is my sister. "13th July, 1873," I think that is the date of his death. "When and where buried." I think that is all correct, so far as I know. "Birthplace, Hallé, Germany." I cannot say whether it was Hallé, Germany, or not. Hallé was in Germany in 1873, when he died. Hallé was in Saxony, I believe, but he was not born there. He was born in Paris, when his parents were on a visit there. They were well-to-do people, and used to take a month's holiday. I understood from him that he was born while they were visiting Paris, but that Saxony was his native land; his progenitors lived in Saxony. Then that he fought with Saxony in the war (the date of which I cannot give) against Prussian domination trying to envelop Saxony in the German Federation. He had wounds as the result of the war. He was warned—given three months, or some such term, in which he must either bow the neck to Prussian domination, leave the country, or be shot. He left the country instead. He gathered his property together. That is all family tradition. He was married at Ipswich. I do not know much about it. Second marriage in Brisbane—he was married a second time. I was born in 1860. I was thirteen when he died. He died in 1873. Then, before I was born, a considerable number of years before, he became a naturalized Englishman—not a Britisher, but a naturalized Englishman. My mother was a native of Ireland. She came out here, as one of a large number of children, to Queensland.

3. We find your father died in 1873. His age was given as 61. That would make his birth in 1812?—That would be about right.

4. And it was in 1815 when Saxony was seized. He was then about three years old?—You get these ideas from the family, and cannot say who tells you. Hallé is in Prussian Saxony. I am not prepared for this. It came as a surprise. I think it was an uncle or somebody, either a barrister or a judge, who was at Hanover,* and I think my father went to

some school some few years after he finished his infantile progress in Paris. That is the family tradition. I have absolutely no documentary evidence to back this up.

5. According to the *Encyclopædia Britannica*, apparently there was no fighting in the 1870 war between Prussia and Saxony; but there was some in the six or seven weeks' war, and in the Napoleonic wars, when your father was only three years old, there was fighting?—My father fought—there is no question about that. He was born in 1812.

6. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—The seven weeks' war took place in 1866, and the Napoleonic war in 1813-14. In 1866 he would then be a British subject?—He was then a naturalized British subject in Australia.

7. He could not have taken part in the war with Saxony in 1813-14. Saxony sided with Napoleon, and Prussia endeavoured to collar the whole of Saxony, but was restricted to the Duchy of Magdeburg and other places, of which Hallé was one. It has been Prussian since 1815.

8. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—The question is where Mr. Sachse's father was born.

9. *By the Chairman.*—According to the death certificate, he was born in Hallé?—At the date when that certificate was filled in, Hallé was Prussian.

10. It was stated that your father was born in France?—Actually born there, but I do not know whether he was registered there.

11. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Your statement is that your father told you that he was born on a visit of his parents to Paris?—His father and mother were there on a visit when he was born. He told us he was born there,* and went to school there for five or six years. I know on one occasion, when he was called to do some medical work in Queensland, there was a French priest at the place, and that my father said, "I was born in Paris, and learnt to speak the language there." I think he said he was there for five or six years, and that the language was like his mother tongue. I do not know how long he stayed in Paris.

12. In your speech in the House, you stated, "My father was born in the city of Paris." That was made on the statement of your father to you?—Yes, on more than one occasion.†

13. You cannot say how the death certificate was filled in?—I do not think his birth was registered in Paris. You may find that my father was registered in Hallé or somewhere else afterwards. I do not know that there was any law then necessitating registration.

14. Have you a family Bible or anything of that kind that would give any information?—I know of nothing of the kind. He may have gone back to Hallé, and then returned to Paris.

15. *By the Chairman.*—If he were at school in Paris, that would probably be so?—Yes. Paris and Hallé are close to each other.

16. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—You stated in your speech, "My father became a naturalized Englishman thirty years before the war took place which blew his native land into Prussia"?—That is a mistake of mine. I was not prepared when this matter was brought up.

17. I think you spoke with some feeling?—I did. There are some inaccuracies in my speech.

* But see answer to question 124.

* But see answer to question 102.

† But see answer to question 105.

18. You also stated that Saxony fought Prussia bitterly?—He was naturalized in 1855, in Queensland, five years before I was born. I have the certificate.

19. Then that statement is inaccurate?—Yes.

20. You stated, "Saxony fought Prussia bitterly, and my father bled fighting Prussia for the good of Saxony, and to keep her away from what he called the hated German Empire." What war was that?—I cannot say; but I know he did. My brother, in writing, told me that father had spoken to him of it.

21. Yet Saxony, according to the *Encyclopædia*, was part of the German Empire when your father was three years of age. This paragraph must, then, be inaccurate?—No; I understand that Saxony was taken over by Germany at the cannon's mouth in 1870.

22. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Hallé has been Prussian since 1815. The next Continental war was the struggle against Denmark, next the Austro-Prussian war, in which Saxony took the part of Austria?—I think my father's people were all in Saxony. I think they were Leipsic people. I do not think they were Hallé people at all. I have a hazy idea about the whole thing.

23. *By the Chairman.*—Is your sister alive?—Yes, she is in Queensland. I think she was about fifteen or sixteen years of age.

24. In 1873?—Yes. I think she is four or six years older than I am. She must have been about sixteen. She did not know anything more about Germany than we did.

25. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—Your family was really a Hallé family?—I cannot tell you.

26. The certificate states that your paternal grandfather held a position there?—I do not know.

27. That is presumptive evidence that your father was domiciled there?—Yes. I believe Leipsic was the home of the family.

28. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Your father was a doctor of medicine?—Yes.

29. There is a distinguished university at Hallé; did he graduate there?—I cannot tell you. There is a diploma of M.D., which describes him as Dr. F. O. Sachse, of Saxony. I have that. I understand that at that date they had to go to Berlin for the higher degrees.

30. *By the Chairman.*—What is the address of your sister, Amelia Frances, who was nineteen when your father died?—Mrs. George Binstead, Canungra, Queensland.

31. Is that the name of a place?—The name of a post town.

32. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—The other document is a registration of birth (*Exhibit "B"*)?—I should like to see that document.

33. *By the Chairman.*—Who supplied the information in that case. The birthplace is given as Hallé?—That is correct.

34. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—You stated that your father was born in Paris?—Yes. He always called Saxony his native place. If you were born in Japan when your parents were travelling, you would not say that you were a native of Japan.

35. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—You said he was born in Paris, and that he stayed there for six years, at school?—Yes; but I do not know whether he stayed straight away. I think he went to an infant school in Paris.

36. You said that your father, though born in Paris, went back to Saxony?—Yes, he told us so.

37. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Can you supply us with any information at all, other than this statement, to show that your father was born in Paris?—Nothing at all.

38. Is your brother older than you?—Yes.

39. *By the Chairman.*—What is his address?—It is very hard to give it to you, but I can get it. He is in Queensland.

40. *By the Hon. T. H. Payne.*—Would he have a family Bible?—No. I do not suppose there is a family with so few family relics. My father hated any talk about the matter. He had a great sword gash from the neck to the shoulder, and two bullet wounds in one of his legs. He got them fighting the Prussians for Saxony, but when I cannot tell you.

41. *By the Chairman.*—The only battle we know of was the seven weeks' war in 1866?—He was in Queensland then.

42. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—I do not know of any Central European war between 1815 and the war against Denmark. There were some riots in 1848 for the establishment of universal suffrage?—There was a rebellion in 1848.

43. There was a rebellion half through Europe, which sent half the thrones tottering, in 1848?—I believe he was in that. He must have been in that. He got his wound all right.

44. It is stated that there was a riot in 1830 in Leipsic and Dresden, and a good deal of internal trouble, and the result was an increase of popular liberty?—It was Prussia he was fighting.

45. *The Hon. T. H. Payne.*—Saxony was merged in Prussia three years after your father was born. If he went back to Hallé, he would be living in Prussia.

46. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—This is from the *Encyclopædia Britannica*, and refers to 1848-49:—

A public demonstration at Dresden in favour of the Frankfort constitution was prohibited as illegal on the 2nd May, 1849. This at once awoke the popular fury. The mob seized the town and barricaded the streets; Dresden was almost destitute of troops; and the King fled to the Königstein. The rebels then proceeded to appoint a provisional Government, consisting of Tzschirner, Heubner, and Todt, though the true leader of the insurrection was the Russian, Bakunin. Meanwhile Prussian troops had arrived to aid the Government, and after two days' fierce street fighting, the rising was quelled. The bond with Prussia now became closer, and Frederick entered with Prussia and Hanover into the temporary "alliance of the three kings." That was in 1849?—I have got some idea that he spoke of the 1848 rebellion.

47. It is evident that it was throughout Saxony as it was throughout Europe.

48. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—We are not asked to deal with these questions. We are asked something definite—where Mr. Sachse's father was born. It is the nationality.

49. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—One has a bearing on the other indirectly.

50. *The Hon. A. Robinson.*—The documentary evidence, although I do not think it is conclusive, seems to indicate that Mr. Sachse's father was born at Hallé, in Germany, and which was a part of Saxony at that date. Afterwards it became a part of Prussia.

51. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—Do not you think we should ask Mr. Sachse if he can bring any evidence to support the statement he made to the House? He said, "My father was born in Paris." Mr. Rees contradicts that. We are asked to decide where he was born. I think we should ask if he can bring any evidence to support the statement he made in the House.

The Witness.—I can say it straight. I can bring nothing more than the verbal statements that I heard my father tell me and others, that he was born in Paris, but that his native place was Saxony.

52. *By the Chairman.*—Did he ever say anything to you to lead you to believe he was born in Saxony?—No.

53. Never at any time?—No.

54. And the only conversation you had with him about his birthplace resulted in his stating that he was born in Paris?—Yes.

55. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—Is there any person living whom your father has ever told that he was born in Paris?—Not a soul, that I know of.

56. You are not aware whether your brother or sister would have the same knowledge?—No.

57. *The Chairman.*—But there is the fact that, at the time of his birth, this part was Saxony, not Germany.*

58. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—One question before we rise. Would either your brother or sister be able to say that your father had stated anything in the same terms as he stated to you?—Possibly.

59. Would you care to have an opportunity of asking them?—Certainly.

60. *The Chairman.*—I think you certainly ought to communicate with the lady in Queensland, because she is the oldest in the family.

The Witness.—There is one point that strikes me before we leave. You have it here marked "Hallé, Prussia," at the date this entry was made. That is the point. It was Prussia when this certificate was made.

61. *By the Chairman.*—Would you like a declaration, or would you write a letter to your sister, and ask her?

62. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—I think it better for the Committee to communicate direct.

The Witness.—I was not prepared to be here or be examined. I hope you will make allowance for that.

The Honorable Member withdrew.

Adjourned to Thursday next at half past three o'clock.

THURSDAY, 21ST FEBRUARY, 1918.

Present:

The Hon. WALTER S. MANIFOLD (in the Chair),

The Hon. W. J. Beckett, The Hon. T. H. Payne,
The Hon. J. K. Merritt, The Hon. A. Robinson.

The Honorable R. B. Rees, examined.

63. *By the Chairman.*—We understood you to say the other night in the House, that you had obtained information on this matter from other people in Toowoomba—is that so?—No. I have other information though with regard to Mr. Sachse, the subject of this inquiry.

64. Perhaps that would not come within the scope of our inquiry as to the parentage or nationality of the father?—I notice that the resolution of the House is in regard to the nationality of the father. I did not take particular heed of it at the time, but I do certainly object to it now, because there are two things to consider; there is the nationality of Dr. Sachse (Mr. Sachse, sen.), and then, so far as I am concerned, the general attitude of Mr. Sachse here as a citizen as indicative of what he aims at in his general political and public career.

65. I am afraid that under the motion appointing us as a Select Committee we cannot go into that. We are merely to inquire into the statements made by the Hon. Mr. Rees in reference to the nationality of the father of the Hon. A. O. Sachse?—Yes, in that connexion, so far as the parentage of Mr. Sachse is concerned, I cannot give you anything further than what those two documents reveal, the one document showing clearly that Mr. Sachse (*i.e.*, Dr. Sachse), was of Prussian origin; that he was born in Hallé, Prussia, and then the second document confirming that by showing that his father, again, was, according to the statement there, a Councillor of Justice. Then one must consider the almost impossibility of his becoming a Councillor of Justice, as we understand Prussian methods, unless he were a loyal Prussian, and was, I

should say, of a certain status in the community; for instance, it would be impossible for us to think that Mr. Sachse, the grandfather (*i.e.*, Dr. Sachse's father), had at any time fought against the Prussian hierarchy.

66. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—The person who was a Councillor of Justice was the father of Mr. Sachse's father?—Yes, that is the person I am dealing with.

67. But we cannot go into anything of that kind?—(No answer.)

68. *By the Chairman.*—Are you aware whether at the date of Dr. Sachse's birth Prussia had anything to do with Saxony?—I am aware that in 1812, Prussia was a separate kingdom.

69. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—Including Hallé?—I am not sure that that was the Hallé mentioned; there are two of them.

70. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—That document does not state which of them it is?—No.

71. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Where is the other Hallé?—In Prussia also.

72. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—It is right up in the West, just on the border of Westphalia, many miles away from this other place.

73. *The Witness.*—I have looked it up, and there are two Hallés; one was taken away from Saxony in the war of 1813, when the King of Saxony joined the French against the Allies, that is, the Rulers of Prussia and Russia. Well, now, my argument is this—that if Mr. Sachse's grandfather—

74. *The Hon. A. Robinson.*—I do not think Mr. Rees is here to make an argument; he is here to give us evidence.

75. *The Witness.*—Well, I want to know what evidence I can give.

76. *By the Chairman.*—I understood that you had a good deal of other information you had collected?—It is merely hearsay. For instance, I had a long talk with Mr. Duncan Cameron, who was a contemporary of Dr. Sachse, and he had no doubt whatever that Dr. Sachse was a Prussian. Mr. Duncan Cameron is the Editor of the *Toowoomba Gazette*, or, rather, the *Darling Downs Gazette*.

77. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—That is the paper from which you have the cutting?—Yes.

78. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—Have you the cutting there?—No, I merely scribbled the purport of it out of the files in the *Toowoomba Gazette* office. I could not take the paper, because it was on the file. Then I had a talk with Mr. Groom, the proprietor and editor of the *Toowoomba Chronicle*, and brother of Mr. Groom, M.H.R. He was a young man, but he remembered old Dr. Sachse well as a boy, and his impression was that he was a Prussian.

79. *By the Chairman.*—Did you get any information at all to show whether Dr. Sachse was born in the Westphalian Hallé, or in the other one?—No; I was not then aware that there were two Hallés in Germany. Since I have come back, however, I have looked up the various authorities, and I find there are two.

80. I have sent word for Mr. Sachse to produce the certificate of naturalization, and also any other documents he had, and, as Mr. Rees cannot give us any further evidence with regard to which Hallé is referred to, I think we had better call in Mr. Sachse and see what documents he has got.

81. *The Witness.*—I want most certainly to put in evidence which is here on record of Mr. Sachse's general conduct.

82. *The Hon. T. H. Payne.*—You will have to deal with the House for that; we have to confine ourselves to the nationality of Dr. Sachse.

83. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—Our duty is confined within the four corners of the resolution passed in the House?—Yes, that is the trouble. The two documents I placed before the House are the only evidence I can possibly produce.

* But see question 147.

84. *By the Chairman.*—You understand that neither of these documents gives the slightest indication as to whether Hallé was in Saxony at the time of the birth of Dr. Sachse, although it certainly was at the time the certificates were signed?—Yes, and I also want to say, as showing that Mr. Sachse believed that he was of alien origin, that he did not vote at the last Referendum; he never applied for a vote, and that shows his guilty knowledge of the position.

85. There may have been fifty other reasons which stopped him from voting?—But he and his lady are supposed to be strong conscriptionists.

86. We cannot go into that matter?—Very well.

The Honorable Member withdrew.

The Honorable A. O. Sachse, further examined.

87. *By the Chairman.*—I sent a message to you asking if you had any documentary evidence touching in any way upon your father's status, especially in regard to naturalization and anything else you had?—Yes, I have here my father's diploma as a doctor of medicine and surgery—[*handed in and marked Exhibit "C"*].

88. At what university was that issued?—The University of Berlin.

89. What does it say?—It is all in Latin, but I had it translated last night. It has the usual preamble of the diplomas issued at the University. It is dated 1839, and at the date of its issue my father was 27 years of age. After the preamble it says, according to the translation:—

J. F. C. Hecker—[*here follow six lines of his distinctions*]—Dean of the Medical Faculty, upon the most distinguished and most learned man, Frederick Otto Sachse, a Saxon, a most worthy candidate in medicine, after he had undergone a rigorous test and examination and had publicly upheld a dissertation on hip disease, on the 19th day of the month of December, 1839, duly conferred the privileges and immunities of a Doctor of Medicine and Surgery.—[*Here follows reference to the Seal.*]

You will notice that it reads "a Saxon," and not "of Saxony." Then, I also have here a letter from the police magistrate of Ipswich, New South Wales, but which is now Ipswich, Queensland. This relates to his naturalization, dated 14th April, 1855—[*handed in and marked Exhibit "D"*].

90. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—That is not a copy of the naturalization paper itself?—No, but it would appear to be all there is, evidently. This was in 1855, five years before I was born; and my father was practising in Ipswich then.

91. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—He would make a declaration when he was naturalized—could that be got at Ipswich, or would it be necessary to refer to the Supreme Court at Sydney?—In any case it is 63 years old, and I suppose there would be some difficulty in finding it.

92. *By the Chairman.*—Anyhow, the diploma is from the Berlin University, and one would have thought it likely that if he were a Prussian he would have described himself as a Prussian, yet he is described there as a Saxon?—I think I might fairly say that it might be regarded as sure that if he had been a Prussian he would never have been put down as a Saxon.

93. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—And if it had been translated as "of Saxony" it would still have the same effect?—Yes, but it is not "of Saxony," it is "a Saxon."

94. The important point is as to the identification of the town of Hallé—whether it is the one that is now and always has been Prussian, or whether it is the other one?—Quite so.

95. *By the Chairman.*—We have had some difficulty in finding out when your father was wounded; it must

have been 1848-1849?—Yes, that would fit in with his having come out here about that time.

96. So far as you know, did he come straight out here?—I think so—to South Australia.

97. *By the Hon. T. H. Payne.*—Where did he reside between 1839-1845?—I can only opine as to that. I hesitate, naturally, about giving a statement. I find that I have made several errors, both in the House and here, on points of that sort. I can merely give my impressions. I was a child at the time, and I am merely drawing upon something in my mind; it would not be there unless I had heard it somewhere. I think my father came out to South Australia first. I never heard in what ship, but I understood he took a very long time to come out here in a sailing vessel. He went to South Australia first, because years afterwards I met Baron von Mueller, and he asked whether I was any relation to Dr. Sachse, of Queensland, and he paid him a very high compliment as a medical man. Dr. von Mueller went to South Australia, and I understood they were pretty close friends when they came out. The Baron went exploring, and my father went to practice. I think they were together somewhere in South Australia, and my father went to Queensland somewhere about 1851, and he was a single man then.

98. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Is it within your knowledge, or do you know by repute, that a considerable immigration from Germany to America and Australia took place at about that time?—Yes, a lot of University men left Germany—doctors, barristers, and students. I have heard all that talk somewhere or other, and I remember my brother once telling me that my father had told him that he received his wounds, which were quite obvious, in the neck and knee, as a surgeon fighting against the Prussians. I heard that from my brother, who is a little older than I; but so far as the birth of my father is concerned, all I know is, that, as a boy of ten or eleven years of age, I remember his saying to some people that he had been born in Paris, in France.

99. *By the Chairman.*—In the death certificate it states that the late Dr. Sachse's father was a Councillor of Justice; would that be a Councillor of Justice in Prussia?—I have not the slightest idea; that would be in Hallé evidently from that record, in Saxony.

100. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—You said just now you heard him tell some friends that he had been born in Paris?—Yes, I had that in my mind.

101. You said on Tuesday last that he told you?—Yes. I was going to correct that in the evidence.

102. In the previous evidence you say, "He told us he was born there." Now, just this minute you said that you heard him tell some friends?—Yes, I want to refer to the evidence, please. I might explain that the other night I was called away in the middle of dinner, and I did not know that I had to give evidence. I had to give evidence to the best of my ability. I have since looked the matters up, and I find one or two little discrepancies which can be very quickly put right. In this particular instance, as near as I can remember, I must have been ten or eleven years of age, when my father was addressing two people, one of the men being a French priest. This priest was a visitor, and he could not speak English, and he said, "Why, doctor, you speak French like a Frenchman," and my father said, "I was born in Paris, and I learned to speak French there." To the best of my recollection he said he was born there, though he always said that Saxony was his native land all through. I would like now to correct my previous evidence, if I may. There is one correction to be made in regard to question No. 11, where it reads "He told us he was born there." It should be altered to read, "He said he was born there."

103. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—You still adhere to your statement about his spending some years in

school in Paris?—Yes, that is my impression—that he said that. I cannot say whether he stopped there immediately from the time of his birth. I think he went back home, and that years afterwards he went back to Paris to school as a pupil, because the French then held a high position in regard to infant education. I believe he said he spent five or six years in Paris or France. I do not know how long he stayed in Paris.

104. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—In question No. 12, it reads—

“12. *The Hon. A. Robinson.*—In your speech in the House you stated ‘My father was born in the city of Paris.’ That was made on the statement of your father to you?—Yes, on more than one occasion.”

You think now that that is not correct?—No, I do not think it is correct. I have been telling you just now what I can remember explicitly. I cannot remember more than one occasion explicitly, but I have the impression that he did tell us. I wish to alter that.

105. *By the Chairman.*—How?—As I said in the preceding paragraph—“He said he was born there.” I would not say that occurred on more than one occasion, but I would say it occurred on one occasion. I will alter it to read, “On the occasion mentioned above.” It was not said to me.

106. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—You overheard him saying to two others?—Yes. I wish the words “To you” left out in question No. 12.

107. That is Mr. Robinson’s question. The words “To you” are his, and you cannot eliminate his words, but you can alter your reply.

108. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—How far is Hallé from Paris?—About 500 miles.

108A. You said they were very close together?—That is as close as from here to Sydney. It was the Hallé in Saxony. I think the diploma fixes it, in my mind, that that is the Hallé referred to in both these declarations—the one in Saxony.

109. *By the Hon. T. H. Payne.*—Your father was married twice; were there any children by the first marriage?—Amelia Frances, Francis, and I are the children by the first marriage.

110. *By the Chairman.*—Is there anything else you wish to state?—I would like to refer to the various corrections I wish made.

111. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—In that paragraph you are very definite that your father was born in Paris while your parents were on a visit there?—I am going on what he told us—on what I overheard him say at that interview.

112. But it is very definite, because you say he was taking a month’s holiday presumably at the time. There must have been several circumstances in your mind to fix that, because it is such a definite statement?—No, there was nothing at all in my mind.

113. *By the Chairman.*—You say he was born in Paris—that is, to the best of your belief?—Yes, I can only speak of what I heard.

114. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Do you say that, to the best of your belief, he was born in Paris?—Yes.

115. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—Do you still say that now after seeing these documents?—Yes, I have only my recollection to go on; I might make a mistake, but that is my recollection.

116. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—The difficulty is this—there is your definite statement in the House that your father was born in Paris, and, as against that, there is a definite statement, supported by documentary evidence, that he was born in Hallé, which was Saxony at the time. If in the House you had stated, “Well, to the best of my belief, I have heard my father state to others that he was born in Paris while his parents were there on a holiday,” that would

be a different statement altogether?—Yes, but honorable members must remember this—that the speech made by Mr. Rees came up suddenly, without any knowledge on my part, and I had to reply suddenly, and I dropped into several little inaccuracies, which one naturally does in a hurried reply. Had I known the matter would have resolved into this, I would not have replied straight away.

117. Well, now, in the light of the information that has been supplied to this Committee, and brought under your notice, do you still think, as against this documentary evidence, that your father was born in Paris?—Naturally, those documents shake my belief as against my own recollection.

118. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—You can only speak from your recollection?—Yes, I can only remember my father saying that; what else can I say—I can only say what I feel and know and think.

119. *By the Hon. A. Robinson.*—Did you ever at any time have occasion to obtain the death certificate of your father?—Never.

120. Were you ever at any time aware of the contents of the registration of his death?—Never.

121. I take it, therefore, that you made the statement to the House resting it on your recollection of the conversation you mentioned?—Yes, absolutely. I have never seen a copy of my own birth certificate until it was brought here.

122. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—Were there any other brothers or sisters whom you have lost, and whose deaths have been registered?—No.

123. *By the Chairman.*—Is there anything else that you wish to correct in the evidence?—There is a statement in answer to question No. 4 where it mentions “Who was at Hanover.” I do not know anything about Hanover, and I do not think I said anything about it. I cannot account for that being there.

124. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt.*—I think you said Hallé, not Hanover?—Yes, it should be altered to Hallé.

125. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—This is all on a supposition derived from a recollection of a conversation which took place many years ago, and it is evidently built up on the supposition that the father was born in Paris; is it within your recollection that, included in the same conversation, your father said he was educated or had spent some portion of his early life in Paris?—No, I am merely giving impressions. I cannot remember the details of the conversation at all.

126. *By the Chairman.*—The whole thing is founded merely on memory?—Yes. Now, with regard to question 10, viz.:—

“10. The Chairman, it was stated that your father was born in France?—Actually born there, but I do not know whether he was registered there.”

In that case I would like the word “actually”

127. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—It is as well to see the position we are getting into. We are altering the whole of the sense of the evidence completely. These are not only grammatical or typographical alterations.

128. *The Hon. A. Robinson.*—But I take it that they will be set out completely in the evidence to-day. The original evidence will be printed, and to-day’s evidence printed separately, instead of making the alterations on the original, so that it will not alter the records.

129. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett.*—In this case, in response to the Chairman’s question (No. 10), the witness stated his father was “actually born” in Paris. At that time it seems there was no doubt in Mr. Sachse’s mind as to his father being born in Paris,

and all his evidence is built up on that. To-day there is a doubt in his mind, and his recollection now is in consequence of a conversation he heard. In the light of the documentary evidence available, it would appear that his father was born in Hallé in Saxony, and that makes a considerable difference. In the light of that evidence, it alters the questions to which we were anticipating receiving answers from another source.

130. *The Chairman*.—I think myself that if a person was born in another country while his parents were there on a temporary visit, that would not alter his nationality?

131. *The Hon. A. Robinson*.—No; it would not.

132. *The Chairman*.—The nationality of the child would be according to the domicile of the parents?

133. *The Hon. A. Robinson*.—Yes.

134. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—But there is nothing definite about the parents at all now—it is simply recollection?—I think I mentioned that in speaking before. I have no evidence whatsoever as to his being born in Paris.

135. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—You were very definite last Tuesday night, and in this question No. 10 you emphasized the matter by saying that he was “actually born” there. Now you wish to alter it, which shows that your mind has undergone some change on the subject; you want to strike out “actually”?—Well, leave it in. I did not know what “actually born” meant.

136. I think you wanted to emphasize it?—No; I did not know the difference between being “actually born” and “born.” We will leave it as it is.

137. *The Chairman*.—Is there anything further?—I have a number of things, but if there is any objection I will not alter them at all. I just spoke in a conversational manner on that evening.

138. *The Hon. A. Robinson*.—You may correct the evidence if you confine yourself to corrections of inaccuracies, and not as to the importance of the language.

139. *By the Hon. T. H. Payne*.—Would not your brother be likely to know more of this matter than you?—No, I do not think he knows anything at all about it. I do not think he could give you any information.

140. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—And it would be a difficult matter to get him?—Yes, it would.

141. Is there anybody else who could help us; is there any old person who was a close relative of your father's?—Not a soul; it is so long ago.

142. There is no kind of record that you can think of?—No, there is only one man that I can think of who knew my father. I have seen him and asked him, and he did not know anything whatever, except that he knew he was a very nice fellow, and so on. There is one thing that I find a difficulty in regard to, and no doubt every one else does the same—that is, in regard to “German” and “Germany.” It appears that everything south of the Rhine was called Germany—that is, before the German Empire was created. All those States were called German States, and I get mixed up, so that I do not know what they are.

143. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—The other Hallé is on the Rhine, is it not?—It is the Saxony Hallé; there is no doubt about that.

144. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—Before the Franco-Prussian War, there were States like Baden and Wurtemberg, forming a confederacy, and it was not until the Franco-Prussian War of 1870-71 that the German Empire was established?—That is so. Then with regard to question 57 of the printed evidence, viz. :—

“57. The Chairman: But there is the fact that, at the time of his birth, this part was Saxony,

not Germany.” It would be Germany, because everything south of the Rhine was called Germany. Where Germany is mentioned in that question I think it should be altered to “Prussia” or “The German Empire.”

145. But it is not the German Empire?—That is where the whole fogging comes in.

146. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—The Chairman's intention was apparently to say, “Saxony, not Prussia”?—Yes.

147. *The Chairman*.—I think we might alter “Germany” to “Prussia” in that question, because that was certainly in my mind. It was an independent Kingdom altogether?—I have always regarded it as being an entirely separate kingdom—up to the time the Prussians took the first and the German Empire absorbed the rest of it.

148. *The Hon. A. Robinson*.—It was a federation, not an absorption; the countries had their own postage stamps and their own coinage.

149. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—But they have not now.

150. *The Hon. A. Robinson*.—Yes, they have.

151. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—I do not know whether it is a fair question to ask, but, subject to your approval, Mr. Chairman, I would like you to ask Mr. Sachse, whether his father, when he was alive, considered he was a Prussian, or whether he was generally considered a Prussian.

152. *The Chairman*.—I think that is a fair question, but Mr. Sachse has given evidence that his father detested Prussia.

153. *The Witness*.—To my knowledge he always called himself a Saxon, and he has told us many times that in Saxony, “Sachse” meant “Saxon.” My name is absolutely a Saxon name.

154. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—Prior to the advent of this war, we did not hear any of these descriptions at all—a German was a German, no matter where he came from, but now, since the war, if they were born in certain districts they do not consider themselves Germans.

155. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—We have the history of the absorption of Schleswig-Holstein, by the Germans—they did not call themselves Germans, and they naturally resented being called Germans.

156. *The Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—But that was hardly the case four or five years ago, and if such a man were then asked if he were of German descent, he would say “yes.”

157. *The Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—Yes, I think we know that the federation of the German Empire in 1871 led to a great outburst of German nationalism, and any one in any of the States forming the German Empire afterwards called himself a German.

158. *By the Hon. W. J. Beckett*.—I suppose if we had asked you, Mr. Sachse, three or four years ago if you were of German descent, you would have said, “Yes, I am a German”?—No, I would have said that I was a Saxon, because my father was always so opposed to being called a German. I think many people here could tell you that I have always disowned the word “German.” When “Prussia” came up my father always spoke very bitterly against it as having been the country that robbed him of his native land. He was intensely bitter against it.

The Honorable Member withdrew.

The Committee adjourned until Tuesday next at a quarter to 4 o'clock.

TUESDAY, 26TH FEBRUARY, 1918.

Present:

The Hon. WALTER S. MANIFOLD (in the Chair),
The Hon. W. J. Beckett, | The Hon. A. Robinson.
The Hon. J. K. Merritt, | The Hon. T. H. Payne,

The Honorable A. O. Sachse, further examined.

159. *The Witness*.—It is very good of the Committee to give me an opportunity of reading a letter which arrived at the moment I telephoned to you. This is from Mr. R. Falkiner. Attached to the letter is a cutting from the *Courier*, presumably the *Brisbane Courier*, of 23rd February, 1918. The cutting is as follows:—

A QUESTION OF NATIONALITY.

Melbourne, 21st February.

Evidence was taken at the State Parliament House to-day by the Select Committee appointed by the Legislative Council to inquire into the charges made by Mr. Rees, M.L.C., as to the nationality of Mr. Arthur Otto Sachse, M.L.C. Mr. Sachse, called, produced a diploma of medicine and surgery issued to his father by the Berlin University in 1839. He stated that it described Dr. Sachse as a Saxon, or of Saxony. He wished it stated that Saxony was his father's homeland, and his native land. He still thought that his father was born in Paris. He had never seen a copy of his own birth certificate till it was brought before the Committee. A considerable number of years before he was born his father was naturalized. His mother was born in Ireland. After deliberating upon the evidence the Committee adjourned till Tuesday, when it will further deliberate, and will consider its draft report.

At a quarter to 4 to-day—at 3.45 to the minute—the postman delivered this letter at my office, with the office letters. It is as follows:—

Wynnum, Queensland,
23rd February, 1918.

My Dear Old Friend,

In glancing over the *Brisbane Courier* I noticed an article which I enclose. I remember your dear old father in 1867. I was then manager of the Australian Joint Stock Bank at Toowoomba. He and I were very intimate and friendly, and had many chats about old times. He told me he was a number of years in France (Paris). He was a loyal man, and told me he never wished to return to the Old Country. To tell you candidly, I was quite convinced he was a Frenchman. If you think my evidence of any value I will go down to Melbourne at my own expense. Will wire you on Monday, too late to-day, just in time for mail.

I remain with kind regards,

Yours very sincerely,

R. FALKINER.

Excuse the scrawl. I am 75 years of age, and at times suffer from rheumatism.

Wire me on receipt.

I desire to put this in. It was unasked for, and was sent voluntarily.

160. *The Chairman*.—Of course there is no evidence in that. It is only a matter of the writer's belief about Mr. Sachse's father being a Frenchman. Mr. Payne wishes to ask a question.

161. *The Witness*.—I wish also to say this. I mentioned the other day that there was an old friend of my father's here, but that I did not think he could give any particular evidence as to my father's place of birth. But he knew my father very well, and you could call him for whatever his evidence may be worth. He wrote

me the following letter from the Commercial Travellers' Club:—

Melbourne, 20th February, 1918.

Dear Mr. Sachse,

In reference to what appears in this morning's dailies, although your late father's character is not in question, I wish to say that I had the pleasure of knowing him in Toowoomba in 1865. He was a worthy man, popular, and as a medical man stood high in reputation.

Yours sincerely,

W. FINUCANE.

The Hon. A. O. Sachse, M.L.C.

I will put that letter in for whatever it may be worth. I have seen, by the newspapers only, that the Honorable R. B. Rees, when visiting Queensland, had an interview with the proprietor of the *Toowoomba Chronicle*, H. Groom, a brother of Mr. Groom, M.H.R. I only had this evidence given me a few minutes ago. Mr. Rees said in his evidence—

Then I had a talk with Mr. Groom, the proprietor and editor of the *Toowoomba Chronicle*, and brother of Mr. Groom, M.H.R. He was a young man, but he remembered old Dr. Sachse well as a boy, and his impression was that he was a Prussian.

I cannot say exactly what is Mr. Harry Groom's age, but I do not think he is more than one year older than I am, so that his impression as to whether my father was a Prussian, or a Saxon, or a Chimpanzee is of no value. It is not evidence of value if he was only about fourteen when my father died.

162. *By the Hon. T. H. Payne*.—Do you know whether your father was insured at death?—No, he was not, unfortunately.

163. As a rule the place of birth is put down in the particulars of the insurance?—I do not think my father's life was ever insured.

164. *By the Hon. J. K. Merritt*.—Of course, you know where he was buried?—In Toowoomba.

165. Do you know if his birthplace is stated on his gravestone?—It states that it is in memory of Frederick Otto Sachse, M.D. The stone bears the name of my mother, to whom he was devotedly attached until the hour of her death. I think, but I am not quite sure, that the one stone carries four names. There is no mention of the birthplace on it. As I have explained, we have not many family relics, but my recollection of what my father said to me is very keen and vivid, although it was 45 years ago. I should like to say, with regard to the other gentleman whom Mr. Rees refers to as having said something about knowing my father to be a Prussian, that I do not think he was there during my father's lifetime, or at the time of my father's death. I think if that statement is to be considered at all, it should be tested in the same way as that of Mr. Harry Groom. Mr. Harry Groom's evidence is utterly valueless. I should mention another thing. In 1862 my father was appointed coroner of the district—that was, the chief magistrate. Mr. Robinson will know what the position of the coroner of Darling Downs would be. It is an office he held for some years. I do not know how many years. The ages of the writers of the two letters I have produced are about 72 or 73. They both speak of my father as a highly educated gentleman. Mr. Finucane says my father was a great humorist, and the entertainer of any society he was in, and a highly cultured English speaker. Mr. Rees says my father did not understand the language or customs of the place. Yet at that time he was coroner of the district.

166. *The Chairman*.—I do not think that has a bearing on the subject.

167. *The Witness*.—That letter completely verifies my statement as to my father's French leanings and French education.

The Honorable Member withdrew.

APPENDICES.

EXHIBIT "A."

Certificate No. 45881.

DEATHS IN THE DISTRICT OF TOOWOOMBA IN THE COLONY OF QUEENSLAND.
Registered by Thomas P. Haslam.

No.	Description.			(1) Cause of death. (2) Duration of last illness. (3) Medical Attendant by whom certified, and (4) When he last saw deceased.	Name and Surname of Father and Mother (Maiden Surname), if known, with rank or profession.	Signature, Description, and Residence of Informant.	(1) Signature of District Registrar. (2) Date, and (3) Where registered.	If Burial Registered.		Where born, and how long in the Australian States, stating which.	If Deceased was Married—	
	When and where died.	Name and Surname, Rank, or Profession.	Sex and age.					When and where buried. Undertaker by whom certified.	Name and Religion of Minister or Names of Witnesses of Burial.		(1) Where, and at what (2) Age, and to whom. (3) Whom.	Issue, in order of Birth, their names and ages.
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)	(13)
1850	13th July, 1873. Margaret-street, Toowoomba	Frederick Otto Sachse. Doctor of Medicine.	Male, 61 years.	(1) Debility. (2) Six weeks. (3) C. J. Anderson. (4) 12th July, 1873.	Johannes Sachse. Councillor of Justice. Fredericka Wache.	Certified in writing by Amelia Frances Sachse. Daughter of deceased. Margaret-street, Toowoomba.	(1) Thos. P. Haslam. (2) 15th July, 1873. (3) Toowoomba.	17th July, 1873. Toowoomba Cemetery. C. T. Edwards.	Rev. W. Abraham. Church of England. C. T. Edwards. L. Bubeck.	Halle, Germany. 20 years in the Colony.	(1) 1st—Ipswich, Queensland. 2nd—Brisbane, Queensland (2) 1st—40 years. 2nd—56 years. (3) 1st—Jane Glisson 2nd—Elizabeth Schermeister	Living. years (1st) Amelia 19 Frances Francis .. 16 Arthur Otto 13 Deceased—none. Living. years (2nd) Clarence 3 Herbert .. 2 Deceased—none.

I, JOHN JOSEPH LEAHY, District Registrar, do hereby certify that the above is a true copy of an entry in a Register of Deaths kept in the District Registry Office at Toowoomba, and I further certify that I am a person duly authorized by law to issue such certificate.

Extracted this fourteenth day of February, 1918.

(Sgd.) J. J. LEAHY,
District Registrar.

11

(Copy.)
1860.

EXHIBIT "B."

Certificate No. 36569.

BIRTHS IN THE DISTRICT OF DRAYTON, IN THE COLONY OF QUEENSLAND.
Registered by G. H. Loveday.

No.	CHILD.		PARENTS.			INFORMANT.	WITNESSES.	REGISTRAR.
	When and where born.	Name and Sex, whether present or not.	Father.		Mother.			
(1)	(2)	(3) (4)	(1) Name and Surname. (2) Rank or profession of the father. (3) Age, and (4) Birthplace.	(1) When and where married. (2) Previous issue, living and deceased.	(1) Name and maiden surname of the mother. (2) Age, and (3) Birthplace.	(1) Signature, Description, and Residence of Informant.	(1) Accoucheur. (2) Nurse, or (3) Names of witnesses.	(1) Signature of District Registrar. (2) Date, and (3) Where registered.
(1)	(2)	(3) (4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)
153 357	22nd May, 1860 Toowoomba.	Arthur Otto, male. Not present	(1) Otto Sachse. (2) Doctor of Medicine. (3) 48 years. (4) Halle, Prussia.	(1) 1852, Ipswich, Queensland. (2) Amelia Frances, 7. Francis Herbert, 4. Both living.	(1) Frances Jane Glissan. (2) 23 years. (3) Nina, Ireland.	Otto Sachse. Father. Toowoomba.	(1) Otto Sachse. (2) Mrs. Minehan. (3) Mrs. Glissan.	(1) G. H. Loveday. (2) 13th July, 1860. (3) Drayton.

I, NORMAN JAMES MACLEOD, Registrar-General, do hereby certify that the above is a true copy of an entry in a Register of Births kept in the General Registry Office, Brisbane, and I further certify that I am a person duly authorized by law to issue such certificate.

Extracted this seventh day of February, 1918.

(Sgd.) N. J. MACLEOD,
Registrar General,

12

EXHIBIT "C."

TRANSLATION.

Translation of Diploma issued to Dr. F. O. Sachse on the 19th December, 1839.

(Usual preamble of Diploma of Frederick William University).

J. F. C. Hecker (here follow six lines of his distinctions), Dean of the Medical Faculty, upon the most distinguished and most learned man, Frederick Otto Sachse, *a Saxon*, a most worthy candidate in medicine, after he had undergone a rigorous test and examination and had publicly upheld a dissertation on Hip Disease, on the 19th day of the month of December, 1839, duly conferred the privileges and immunities of a Doctor of Medicine and Surgery (here follows reference to the seal).

(Copy.)

EXHIBIT "D."

No. 55/71.

Police Office,
Ipswich, 14th April, 1855.

Sir,

In reply to your communication of the 11th inst., requesting me to forward to you a testimonial stating that you had taken the oath of Naturalization before me, and paid the necessary fees into this Office for the same, I do myself the honour to state that the oath of Naturalization under the Act 11. Vict. £1 16 6 No. 39 was duly taken by you before me, and the fee of One pound sixteen shillings and sixpence was paid by you into this Office and forwarded on from hence to Prothonotary of the Supreme Court, Sydney.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your obedient servant,

(Sgd.) CHA. GEO. GRAY,
P.M.

OTTO SACHSE, Esq.,
Warwick.